



**Evidence for
Excellence in
Education**

Report

Character Education: a Bibliography of Recent Research, Reports and Resources

National Foundation for Educational
Research (NFER)

Public



Character Education: a Bibliography of Recent Research, Reports and Resources

Amanda Taylor

Published in April 2017
By the National Foundation for Educational Research,
The Mere, Upton Park, Slough, Berkshire SL1 2DQ
www.nfer.ac.uk

© 2017 National Foundation for Educational Research
Registered Charity No. 313392

ISBN 978-1-911039-49-5

How to cite this publication:

Taylor, A. (2017). *Character Education: a Bibliography of Recent Research, Reports and Resources*. Slough: NFER.

Contents

Introduction	i
1 Principles/Frameworks	2
2 Think Pieces/Policy Recommendations	3
3 Guidance and Resources	5
4 Research	8
5 Programme/Intervention Evaluations	10
6 Reviews	15
Appendix: Summary of Search Parameters, Sources and Keywords	17

Introduction

In September 2016 the Association for School and College Leaders (ASCL) and Pearson commissioned the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER) to undertake a literature review on approaches to the effective leadership, planning and delivery of character education. The evidence base identified was not sufficiently robust to answer our specific research questions, so we did not pursue the review. Nonetheless, our extensive searches¹ revealed a wide range of research, reports and resources on character education. These provide useful further reading for those involved in developing effective provision in this area.

The bibliography which follows includes a selection of reports, research and resources published since 2010 which we consider will be of most interest to school leaders. It is not an exhaustive list and inclusion does not imply endorsement.

We have provided links to all resources correct at the time of publication. Many are freely available online but the full-text of some articles published in peer-reviewed journals are behind a paywall, in which case the link provided goes to a full abstract.

¹ An overview of the searches we undertook is provided in the Appendix.

1 Principles/Frameworks

1. **Association for Character Education (2016). *9 Principles*. Online. Available: <http://www.character-education.org.uk/9-principles> [28 March, 2017].**

The Association for Character Education (a UK based membership organisation established in 2015) has set out nine principles which define excellence in character education.

2. **Character.org (no date). *11 Principles of Effective Character Education*. Online. Available: <http://info.character.org/11-principles-download> [28 March, 2017].**

The US-based Character.org (formerly the Character Education Partnership) has set out 11 principles of effective character education covering curriculum integration, extra-curricular activities, parent and community partnerships and staff development.

3. **Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (no date). *Framework for Character Education in Schools*. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: <http://jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/other-centre-papers/Framework..pdf> [28 March, 2017].**

This framework sets out the Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues' key principles for character education and the virtues deemed to constitute good character.

2 Think Pieces/Policy Recommendations

4. Birdwell, J., Scott, R. and Reynolds, L. (2015). *Character Nation*. London: Demos [online]. Available: https://www.demos.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/476_1505_characternation_web.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This report published at the start of the current parliament sets out a series of policy recommendations for embedding character development across the education system. It drew on recent research, workshops and expert interviews.

5. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues and #1will (no date). *Statement on Youth Social Action and Character Development*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues and #1will [online]. Available: <http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/StatementSocialAction.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

The Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues and the #iwill campaign have developed this statement setting out the ways in which youth social action is an effective and meaningful way to develop young people's character virtues.

6. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (no date). *Statement on Teacher Education and Character Education*. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/character-education/Statement_on_Teacher_Education_and_Character_Education.pdf [28 March, 2017].

The Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues has developed this statement which emphasises the importance of preparing teachers for the moral complexities of the teaching profession and sets out recommendations for teacher education.

7. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (2016). *Building Character through the Longer School Day*. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/PolicyBriefings/LongerSchoolDayPolicyBrief_1September2016.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This policy briefing responds to the announcement in the March 2016 budget of funding to improve sports provision in primary schools and a broader range of activities in secondary schools through a longer school day. It sets out the evidence base for developing character education through such activities.

-
8. Peterson, A., Lexmond, J., Hallgarten, J. and Kerr, D. (2014). *Schools with Soul: a New Approach to Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural Education*. London: RSA [online].
Available: <https://www.thersa.org/globalassets/pdfs/reports/schools-with-soul-report.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This report investigates current practice and makes policy recommendations relating to the provision of SMSC in schools acknowledging the overlap with character education, personal development and social and emotional skills. It argues that changes in education policy are inhibiting 'deeper thinking about how to equip young people with the skills, attitudes, values and capabilities necessary to succeed in the modern world'.

3 Guidance and Resources

9. Arthur, J. and Harrison, T. (2014). *Schools of Character*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online].
Available: <http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/character-education/SchoolsOfCharacterPDF.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This is a collection of seven case studies of schools which make character education a conscious part of their day-to-day practice through a variety of approaches.

10. Harrison, T., Bawden, M., Rogerson, L. (2016). *Teaching Character Education Through Subjects: Educating the Virtues Through and Within 14 Secondary School Subjects*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online].
Available: http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/character-education/Teaching_Character_Through_Subjects.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This is the report of the 'Teaching Character through Subjects' project funded by the Department for Education. The project worked with 29 teachers across England to create a resource for building character across 14 curriculum subjects. The resources for each subject are free to download from this [webpage](#).

11. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues and Step up to Serve (2015). *Transforming Young People and Communities: Inspiring Ideas from Schools and Colleges Developing Character through Youth Social Action*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues and Step up to Serve [online].
Available: http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/Research%20Reports/Transforming_Young_People_and_Communities.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This resource was developed by UK headteachers and principals active in youth social action projects to provide practical advice to other education leaders. It recommends a 'Top 4 things you can do': 1) Put youth social action at the heart of your school or college 2) inspire and reward youth social action 3) empower young people to lead their own social action 4) build strong partnerships.

-
12. Millburn, S., Ravenscroft, T., Groot, J. and Faulkner, A. (2016). *Character Education: a Practical Approach*. London: Enabling Enterprise and UBS [online]. Available: <http://enablingenterprise.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Character-Education-A-Practical-Approach-Guide.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This guide by Enabling Enterprise (a teacher-led partnership of 230 schools and over 110 employers) focuses on six key principles for embedding character education in schools alongside practical steps to put an effective programme into practice, case studies and tips.

13. Floreat Education Academies Trust (2016). *Floreat Character Programme (website)*. Online. Available: <http://www.floreatprogramme.org.uk/> [28 March, 2017].

The Floreat Character Programme, funded by the Department for Education, provides resources to support the development of pupils' character in primary school. The resources include: 1) culture and training materials – how to habituate and model virtuous behaviour 2) the Virtue Literacy programme – guidance for teachers on using children's stories to explore character 3) Service Learning Projects – where pupils apply their understanding of character virtues to a real life scenario. (An evaluation of the pilot programme by the Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues was published in 2016 – available [here](#).)

14. Harrison, T., Arthur, J. and Burn, E. (2016). *Character Education Evaluation Handbook for Schools*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: <http://jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/character-education/EvaluationHandbook/CharacterEducationEvaluationHandbook.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

The Jubilee Centre's evaluation handbook for character education in primary and secondary schools provides advice, guidance and tools to enable schools to implement the principles and practice of self-evaluation to enhance and improve their character education provision.

15. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (no date). *Character Education: Secondary Programme of Study*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: <http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/1636/character-education/resources/secondary-programme-of-study> [28 March, 2017].

This is a free-to-download programme of study for character education in secondary schools with an accompanying teachers' guide.

16. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (2016). *Teaching Character through the Primary Curriculum*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: <http://jubileecentre.ac.uk/1635/character-education> [28 March, 2017].

This is a free-to-download programme of study for character education in primary schools with an accompanying teachers' guide. An evaluation report of the pilot programme is available [here](#).

4 Research

- 17. Arthur, J., Harrison, T., Kristjánsson, K., Davison, I. with Hayes, D. and Higgins, J. (2014). *My Character: Enhancing Future Mindedness in Young People: a Feasibility Study*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online].**

Available: <http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/My%20Character%20PDFs/My%20Character%20pdf%20final.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This research report presents the findings of a feasibility study which ran between 2011 and 2014 and involved over 1000 young people across the UK to develop a better understanding of how interventions designed to develop character might enhance moral formation and future-mindedness.

- 18. Arthur, J., Harrison, T. and Taylor, E. (2015). *Building Character through Youth Social Action: Research Report*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online].**

Available: http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/Research%20Reports/Building_Character_Through_Youth_Social_Action.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This research study using desk research, interviews and focus groups explores how youth social action providers aim to build young people's character. It makes recommendations for practitioners, policy-makers and researchers interested in youth social action.

- 19. Arthur, J., Kristjánsson, K., Walker, D., Sanderse, W. and Jones, C. (2015). *Character Education in UK Schools*. Birmingham: Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online].**

Available: http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/Research%20Reports/Character_Education_in_UK_Schools.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This research project explored the formation of character in students in 68 UK schools (10,000 students and 255 teachers) and investigated how teachers view their role in developing good character and virtue in students. It used a 'triangulated methodology' employing three different ways of measuring adolescent character. Using the results of a moral dilemma test which tested students ethical reasoning it identified 'top' and 'bottom' schools so that they could understand what the 'best' schools were doing to develop character.

-
20. See, B.H. and Arthur, J. (2011). 'The potential of schools and teachers in the character development of young people in England: perspectives from pupils and teachers', *Evaluation and Research in Education*, 24, 2, 143–157 [online]. Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09500790.2011.560664> [28 March, 2017].

This paper draws on the views of 5207 pupils in England across 25 state schools, including five primaries. Pupil accounts suggest that formal education has not done much to develop their character, and this is especially true of secondary pupils. They do suggest that their values can be shaped by their school experiences outside the curriculum. This is in some contrast to the views of teachers who report formal activities intended to promote character development.

5 Programme/Intervention Evaluations

21. Bavarian, N., Lewis, K. M., DuBois, D. L., Acock, A., Vuchinich, S., Silverthorn, N., Snyder, F. J., Day, J., Ji, P. and Flay, B. R. (2013). 'Using social-emotional and character development to improve academic outcomes: a matched-pair, cluster-randomized controlled trial in low income urban schools', *Journal of School Health*, 83, 11, 771–779 (DOI: 10.1111/josh.12093) [online].

Available: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/josh.12093/full> [28 March, 2017].

This study evaluated the impact of Positive Action (a social-emotional and character development programme) on educational outcomes among low-income, urban youth. It found the programme significantly improved growth in academic motivation; mitigated disaffection with learning; had a positive impact on absenteeism and a marginally significant impact on maths performance of all students.

22. Berg, J. K. and Aber, J. L. (2015). *The Direct and Moderating Role of School Interpersonal Climate on Children's Academic Outcomes in the Context of Whole-school, Social-emotional Learning Programs*. Evanston, IL: Society for Research on Educational Effectiveness [online].

Available: <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED562524> [28 March, 2017].

This US-based study used data from a three-year randomised evaluation of social and character development programmes in 83 elementary schools across six states. Amongst a range of findings the results revealed that social and character development programmes do not directly improve academic outcomes.

23. Davison, I., Harrison, T., Hayes, D. and Higgins, J. (2016). 'How to assess children's virtue literacy: methodological lessons learnt from the Knightly Virtues programme', *Journal of Beliefs & Values: Studies in Religion & Education*, 37, 1, 16–28 (DOI: 10.1080/13617672.2016.1141526) [online].

Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13617672.2016.1141526> [28 March, 2017].

This article discusses the challenges of running trials designed to measure character education with reference to the Knightly Virtues programme which draws on selected classic stories to teach eight moral virtues to nine- to 11-year-olds.

-
24. Gareth, R. (2014). 'A helping hand? A study into an England-wide peer mentoring program to address bullying behaviour', *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 22, 3, 210–223 (DOI: 10.1080/13611267.2014.926663) [online].
Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13611267.2014.926663> [28 March, 2017].

This article reports on a study of a peer mentoring programme which matched children aged 9 to 12 years who were bullied or at-risk of being bullied with older pupil mentors. Pupils (n= 372) taking part in the programme and pupils in a comparison group (n=1249) completed a questionnaire at the start and end of the school year. Mentored students reported higher levels of bullying and life satisfaction and statistically significant higher levels of school satisfaction than the comparison group.

25. Gorard, S., See, B.H. Siddiqui, N., Smith, E. and White, P. (2016). *Youth Social Action Trials: Youth United. Evaluation Report and Executive Summary*. London: EEF [online].
Available: [https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/public/files/Publications/Campaigns/Evaluation Reports/EEF Project Report Youth Social Action Trials.pdf](https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/public/files/Publications/Campaigns/Evaluation%20Reports/EEF%20Project%20Report%20Youth%20Social%20Action%20Trials.pdf) [28 March, 2017].

This is the report of the Education Endowment Foundation (EEF) randomised controlled trial of Youth United – a programme which involved uniformed youth organisations being established in schools in six areas of the north of England. Amongst the conclusions there is no evidence that the intervention had any benefit in terms of academic performance; there was a small improvement in self-reported non-attainment outcomes including self-confidence and teamwork; and study participants were extremely positive and felt there were positive effects on behaviour and skills.

26. Kirkman, E., Sanders, M., Emanuel, L. and Larkin, C. (2015). *Evaluating Youth Social Action: Does Participating in Social Action Boost the Skills Young People Need to Succeed in Adult Life*. London: Behavioural Insights Team [online].
Available: <http://www.behaviouralinsights.co.uk/publications/evaluating-youth-social-action-final-report/> [28 March, 2017].

This is an evaluation of social action projects brokered through schools funded under the Youth Social Action Fund (Cabinet Office Centre for Social Action and the Education Endowment Foundation). The evaluation included three randomised controlled trials which found significant improvement in participants' character skills for life and work.

-
- 27. Manchester Institute of Education, University of Manchester PATHS to Success Research Team (2015). *Promoting Alternative Thinking Strategies (PATHS): Evaluation Report and Executive Summary*. London: EEF [online]. Available: <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/our-work/projects/promoting-alternative-thinking-strategies/> [28 March, 2017].**

This is the report of the Education Endowment Foundation (EEF) randomised controlled trial of Promoting Alternative Thinking Strategies (PATHS), a primary school-based social and emotional learning (SEL) curriculum that aims to improve pupils' emotional intelligence, social skills and self-control. Amongst the conclusions the evaluation found that PATHS did not have a positive impact upon children's academic attainment.

- 28. Marshall, J. C., Caldwell, S. D. and Foster, J. (2011). 'Moral education the CHARACTERplus Way®', *Journal of Moral Education*, 40, 1, 51–72 (DOI: 10.1080/03057240.2011.541770) [online]. Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2011.541770> [28 March, 2017].**

This article reports on several US-based studies, including two large-scale experimental investigations, which found that integrated character education results in improvements in school environment, student pro-social and moral behaviour, and reading and maths test scores.

- 29. Rienzo, C., Rolfe, H. and Wilkinson, D. (2015). *Changing Mindsets: Evaluation Report and Executive Summary*. London: EEF [online]. Available: <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/our-work/projects/changing-mindsets/> [28 March, 2017].**

This is the report of the Education Endowment Foundation (EEF) randomised controlled trial of the Changing Mindsets project which sought to improve academic attainment by supporting pupils to develop a growth mindset. Amongst the conclusions the evaluation found that pupils who received the growth mindset workshops made an average of two additional months' progress in English and maths. These findings were not statistically significant, which means that we cannot be confident that they did not occur by chance. However, the finding for English was close to statistical significance, and this suggests evidence of promise.

30. Ruttledge, R., Devitt, E., Greene, G. and Mullany, M. (2016). 'A randomised controlled trial of the FRIENDS for Life emotional resilience programme delivered by teachers in Irish primary schools', *Educational & Child Psychology*, 33, 2, 69–89 [online].

Available: http://www.ucl.ac.uk/educational-psychology/resources/Ruttledge_et_al_2016.pdf [28 March, 2017].

Article reporting on an RCT of the FRIENDS for Life cognitive behavioural based programme designed to reduce childhood anxiety and promote emotional resilience. Measures of anxiety, self-concept, coping, school connectedness and social validity indicated that the FRIENDS for Life programme was positively received by children, parents and teachers.

31. Scott, R. and Cadywould, C. (2016). *On the Front Foot: Independent Evaluation Report*. London: DEMOS [online].

Available: <https://www.demos.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/On-the-Front-Foot.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This is an impact and process evaluation of Premiership Rugby's 'On the Front Foot' programme based on the sport's core values of teamwork, respect, enjoyment, discipline and sportsmanship. The programme was delivered to around 17,000 pupils across primary and secondary schools in England in the 2015/16 school year. Results included statistically significant increases in self-reported 'performance character' amongst secondary-age participants.

32. Scott, R., Reynolds, L. and Cadywould, C. (2015). *Character by Doing: Evaluation. Giving Schools and Non-Formal Learning Providers the Confidence to Work in Partnership*. London: Demos [online].

Available: <https://www.demos.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Demos-Character-by-Doing-Evaluation.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This report presents the findings of a process and impact evaluation of the 'Character by Doing' pilot programme developed by the Scout Association and Demos with funding from the Department for Education's Character Education Fund. Schools worked in partnership with scouting volunteers to give pupils the opportunity to take part in cub activities over two terms. Of note the quantitative evaluation demonstrated only one significant positive impact – on leadership. Teachers and parents mentioned perceived growth in resilience, confidence and cooperation.

-
33. Seider, S., Novick, S. and Gomez, J. (2013). 'The effects of privileging moral or performance character development in urban adolescents', *Journal of Early Adolescence*, 33, 6, 786–820 (DOI: 10.1177/0272431612468318) [online].
Available: <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0272431612468318> [28 March, 2017].

This US study used a quasi-experimental research design to compare the effects of placing emphasis on moral character development (ethical behaviour towards individuals and communities) or performance character development (regulating thoughts and actions to support achievement) at three high-performing, high-poverty urban middle schools. The moral character group demonstrated higher levels of integrity and the performance character group higher levels of perseverance and community connectedness.

34. Snyder, F.J., Vuchinich, S., Acock, A., Washburn, I. J. and Flay, B. R. (2012). 'Improving Elementary School Quality through the Use of a Social-Emotional and Character Development Program: A Matched-Pair, Cluster-Randomized, Controlled Trial in Hawaii', *Journal of School Health*, 82, 1, 11–20 (DOI: 10.1111/j.1746-1561.2011.00662) [online].
Available: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1746-1561.2011.00662.x/abstract> [28 March, 2017].

This US study examined the effects of Positive Action Hawaii: an elementary school-wide social-emotional and character education programme on teacher, parent, and student perceptions of school safety and quality using a matched-pair, cluster-randomised, controlled design. Analyses comparing change from baseline to one-year post-trial revealed that intervention schools demonstrated significantly improved school quality compared to control schools.

6 Reviews

35. Banerjee, R., McLaughlin, C., Cotney, J., Roberts, L. and Peereboom, C. (2016). *Promoting Emotional Health, Well-being and Resilience in Primary Schools*. Cardiff: Public Policy Institute for Wales [online]. Available: <http://ppiw.org.uk/files/2016/02/PPIW-Report-Promoting-Emotional-Health-Well-being-and-Resilience-in-Primary-Schools-Final.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This report provides a synthesis of international research and policy evaluations relating to school-based strategies to promote emotional health, well-being and resilience among primary school pupils (aged 4 to 11).

36. Feinstein, L. (Ed). (2015). *Social and Emotional Learning: Skills for Life and Work*. London: Early Intervention Foundation, Cabinet Office and Social Mobility and Child Poverty Commission [online]. Available: <http://www.eif.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Social-and-Emotional-Learning-Final-Report-1.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This is an overview report of a review commissioned by the Early Intervention Foundation, the Cabinet Office and the Social Mobility and Child Poverty Commission. The review is comprised of three strands: 1) social and emotional skills in childhood and their long term effects (UCL Institute of Education) 2) what works in enhancing social and emotional skills development during childhood and adolescence (National University of Ireland, Galway) 3) a deep dive into social and emotional learning: what do the views of those involved tell us about the challenges for policymakers (ResearchAbility).

37. Gutman, L.M. and Schoon, I. (2013). *The Impact of Non-cognitive Skills for Young People: Literature Review*. London: Education Endowment Foundation and the Cabinet Office [online]. Available: https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/public/files/Publications/EEF_Lit_Review_Non-CognitiveSkills.pdf [28 March, 2017].

This rapid literature review examines the extent to which non-cognitive skills matter for various outcomes and how to robustly measure those skills. It then focuses on the role of programmes and interventions that develop non cognitive skills for children and young people.

38. Heckmann, J. and Kautz, T. (2013). *Fostering and Measuring Skills: Interventions that Improve Character and Cognition*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research [online].

Available: <http://www.nber.org/papers/w19656.pdf> [28 March, 2017].

This literature review covers recent evidence on measuring and boosting cognitive and noncognitive skills. The literature establishes that achievement tests do not adequately capture character skills – personality traits, goals, motivations, and preferences – that are valued in the labour market, in school, and in many other domains. The literature suggests high quality early childhood and elementary (primary) school programmes improve character skills in a lasting and cost-effective way.

39. O’Conner, R. (2017). *A Review of the Literature on Social and Emotional Learning for Students Ages 3–8: Characteristics of Effective Social and Emotional Learning Programs*. Washington DC: IES [online].

Available: <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/projects/project.asp?projectID=443> [28 March, 2017].

This four-part literature review seeks to summarise the benefits of social and emotional learning (SEL) in early childhood, and identify the characteristics of SEL interventions that are effective in the school context. The four parts to the review are 1) characteristics of effective social and emotional learning programmes 2) implementation strategies and state and district support policies 3) teacher and classroom strategies that contribute to social and emotional learning 4) outcomes for different student populations and settings.

Appendix: Summary of Search Parameters, Sources and Keywords

Date of search:	September 2016 ²
Publication date:	2010 to 2016
Geographical scope:	Focus on England/UK but we will consider key international evidence
Language:	Literature published in the English language
Age range	5 to 18 years
Study type:	Methodologically-robust research studies, peer-reviewed articles, frameworks, think pieces and how-to-guides.

- Key education bibliographic databases: British Education Index (BEI) and Education Resource Information Center (ERIC)
- NFER's [‘On the Web’](#) archive of research reports published online
- Peer reviewed journals including: Journal of Moral Education; Ethics and Education, International Journal of Ethics Education and the Journal of Research in Character Education
- Websites including: Association of Character Education, Best Evidence in Brief, Best Evidence Encyclopaedia, Cabinet Office, Center for Character and Citizenship (University of Missouri) , Character.org (formerly Character Education Partnership), Character Counts, Character Lab, DEMOS, Early Intervention Foundation (including the Teaching and Learning Toolkit), Education Policy Institute, Education Endowment Foundation, Enabling Enterprise, Floreat Education, Future Foundations/National Citizen Service, Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (University of Birmingham), Ofsted, ReachOut, Step up to Serve, UK education departments, VIA Institute of Character, What Works Clearinghouse.

We used the following keywords to search the bibliographic databases. These are based on the thesaurus terms used in the ERIC database and were tailored to the controlled vocabularies used in the other bibliographic databases and supplemented by free-text (FT) terms as appropriate.

² Item 39 published in 2017 was added as it was identified during production of this bibliography however the original searches were not re-run.

The keywords reflect the definition of character education³ we have agreed for this project as far as is practicable and were devised with reference to the Jubilee Centre's *A Framework for Character Education*⁴.

Character education

Character building (FT)

Character development (FT)

Character education (FT)

Character traits (FT)

Civic values

Empathy

Ethical instruction (used for moral education)

Grit (FT)

Integrity

Moral development

Moral education (FT)

Moral values

Persistence

Personal strengths (FT)

Personality traits (used for Curiosity etc)

Resilience (Psychology)

Values education (used for character education)

Virtues (FT)

³ Approaches to school ethos, the curriculum and extra-curricular activities offered by or through schools which aim to help all pupils build personal strengths, attitudes and values in support of their academic attainment, employability and ability to engage in society as active citizens.

⁴ Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues (no date). *Framework for Character Education in Schools*. Jubilee Centre for Character and Virtues [online]. Available: <http://jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/other-centre-papers/Framework..pdf> [28 March, 2017].

NFER provides evidence for excellence through its independence and insights, the breadth of its work, its connections, and a focus on outcomes.

- independent
- insights
- breadth
- connections
- outcomes

NFER ref. PACE
Public

ISBN. 978-1-911039495

© 2017 National Foundation for Educational Research

**National Foundation for
Educational Research**
The Mere, Upton Park
Slough, Berks SL1 2DQ

T: 01753 574123
F: 01753 691632
E: enquiries@nfer.ac.uk
www.nfer.ac.uk